



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT CALCUTTA

WORKING PAPER SERIES

WPS No. 76/ November 2012

From Market Separation to Market Development at Bottom of P  
Case Studies on Two Non-Profit Organiza

by

Ramendra Singh  
Assistant Professor, Indian Institute of Management Calcutta,

&

Pratik Modi  
(Fellow, IRMA) Faculty Institute of Rural Manage

**From Market Separation to Market Development at Bottom of Pyramid: Case  
Studies on Two Non-Profit Organizations**

**Authors**

**Ramendra Singh** is Assistant Professor (Marketing) at Indian Institute of Management Calcutta. Email: [ramendra@iimcal.ac.in](mailto:ramendra@iimcal.ac.in)

**Pratik Modi** (Fellow, *IRMA*) is a faculty member at the Institute of Rural Management Anand. Email: [pratik@irma.ac.in](mailto:pratik@irma.ac.in)

# From Market Separation to Market Development at Bottom of Pyramid: Case Studies on Two Non-Profit Organizations

## Abstract

*In this working paper, we analyze two non-profit organizations, Digital Empowerment Foundation (DEF), and Barefoot College, and study how these NGOs helped to develop markets at BOP by reducing market separations. We use, and extend Bartel's (1968) theoretical lens of market separations that suggest that markets fail to develop if one or more of the following market separations are present. These market separations are- temporal separation, financial separation, information separation, and spatial separation. In our case studies, we also find fifth and a new market separation which we label, " Capability Separation" that connotes the lack of adequate market-skills with producers and/or consumers to participate in the markets, and which if present, can mitigate market development at BOP. We propose that our case studies provide new insights on market separations perspective to developing markets at BOP by paying more attention to specific market separations that inhibit market development, as highlighted in our case studies. We also propose that capabilities separation is the not only the 'only human separation' but also acts as a catalyst such that reducing this separation accelerates reduction in the other four market separations. Towards this objective, identification of capabilities or knowledge separation (of poor producers/consumers at BOP) as a key market separation forms one of the major contributions of our research.*

"The poor and illiterate people of our villages do not need charity, they only need opportunity"

- Baba Amte

According to Prahalad and Hammond (2002), the bottom of the pyramid (BOP) refers to that part of the untapped markets of the world that has people living on incomes as low as \$2 a day. Constituting the BOP are almost 4 billion people living primarily in Asia, Africa, and South America. In recent years, many scholars in management have championed the BOP as a market for firms to sell, or source their products and services from. Prahalad (2005) notes that although poverty alleviation and developmental assistance has traditionally been the domain of the government and its developmental agencies, the time has now come for private sector to play a dominant role.

Some scholars do (Karnani 2007), however, challenge the basic premise of developing BOP markets by arguing that the poor are likely to be exploited by companies trying to sell them products or services that they might not actually need. These critics also argue that to save the poor from exploitation, given their vulnerabilities, the companies should

---

The case writers would like to thank Arindam Sur for providing valuable research assistance for drafting these case studies.

preferably treat them as producers and source goods and services from them enabling incomes, thereby, and working towards poverty alleviation.

Despite merits on either side of the debate on developing BOP markets, there are several advantages in treating the poor as consumers as well as producers. For one thing, the poor have largely remained absent from the market due to the paucity of a well-functioning or efficient market. Well-functioning markets are those in which producers and consumers interact to successfully engage in market exchanges. The poor can buy/sell at the informal markets of the BOP and participate in formal markets, either as consumers or as producers. Informal markets have already witnessed the participation of the poor both as producers and as consumers (De Soto, 2000). In the formal markets, however, the poor are generally absent in both these capacities.. In formal markets the BOP producers/consumers are separated from other producers/consumers due to several reasons including remote location and geographical dispersion of BOP communities, low and volatile incomes at the BOP, and the presence of exploitative intermediaries in the BOP. Previous research has found that consumers in the BOP typically have low per capita incomes but are large in numbers, which makes them an attractive market prospect (Prahalad, 2006). Moreover, poor consumers, given their awareness of branded goods have developed a high aspiration value for such goods that hold the promise of better quality and are symbols of participation in the market (Prahalad, 2006).

Developing BOP markets (in which the poor participate as consumers) has several merits. For one, the current informal markets at BOP would give way to a more efficient formal market leading to a drop in prices, which indirectly leads to higher disposable income for the poor and an eventual increase in social well-being. For example, an MNC pharmaceutical company intending to sell medicines for treating malaria in malaria-infected African countries would benefit the local society there. The incidence of disease in the affected BOP community would soon diminish causing, eventually, an overall improvement in the healthcare status and social well-being of BOP individuals.. This MNC could build economies of scale to reduce prices and develop a large market across disparate BOP communities in Africa. Participation of the poor as producers in formal markets would lead to income generation, which would eventually turn them into participants (consumers) in those very markets.. The most successful example is that of India's largest tobacco company, ITC. ITC's choupal initiative includes two arms, e-choupal and choupal sagar. The e-choupal is an internet-based information kiosk purveying updates on weather, agri-inputs, cropping patterns, and other relevant information to the small and marginal farmers at BOP helping them increase their farm productivity while building a relationship with ITC as an agriculture advisor. The farmer who sells produce at ITC's choupal sagar fetches a better price compared to one who sells to the government-owned *mandi* (wholesale food grain market). Adjacent to grain procurement point is the choupal sagar retail-store where the farmer can go and shop using the cash that he or she acquired from selling the farm produce. This choupal initiative from the ITC at BOP in India illustrates how companies can profitably treat BOP individuals as both producers as well as consumers.

## **Theoretical Perspective**

In this article we have used the Bartels' (1968) theory of market separations to argue that markets can be developed at the bottom of the pyramid if market separations between producers and consumers in the markets are reduced, if not removed altogether. Bartel proposed that new markets could be developed if the follow

month or less on average) was driven with the larger objective of reducing their dependency on (often) unscrupulous middlemen who exploited them out of market opportunities and kept them out of market. In less than three years many weaving families in Chanderi have been actively participating in the market for finished woven sarees and other forms of Chanderi art.

Our case study throws light on how non-profit organizations like DEF can create an ecosystem of partnerships with other NGOs such as Media Lab Asia (MLA) by working closely with Government of India's Ministry of ICT as well as weavers and other intermediaries as stakeholders to successfully develop the market at BOP. To begin with, we go by the accepted definition of a market being an arrangement whereby buyers and sellers can interact to determine the prices and quantities of a product or service (Samuellson & Nordhaus, 1992). Markets essentially serve three main functions, (1) matching demand and supply (or buyers, and sellers), (2) facilitating exchanges or transactions, and (3) providing institutional infrastructure (Bakos, 1998). In the first function, identification of buyers and sellers, matchmaking product offerings with needs, as well as price discovery is important. In the second function, logistics, payment

separations that are also important, although not as important as information market separation in the Chanderi case.

## **Nature of M ChandmTJ22n2**

**Figure 1: Four market separations, and the four levels at which it operates**

### **Case Study 1: Chanderiyaan Project from Digital Empowerment Foundation (DEF)**

DEF is an NGO registered under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1980, with its own governing body, board of directors, and team members. It is headed by Mr. Osama Manzar, who founded the NGO in 2002. DEF works with the mission and vision of

economically and educationally empowering the poor people through the use of information and communication technology, and the digital media leading to their digital inclusion. Since 2003, DEF has initiated several path-breaking projects in diverse areas of social and economic development using ICT in some form. CWICTRC is one of the several initiatives, besides, Neerjaal, Manthan Award Ceremony for e-Content practices, and Digital Panchyat.

Chanderiyaan is the brand name of Chanderi Weavers ICT Resource Centre (CWICTRC), which started in the Ashok Nagar district of Madhya Pradesh in collaboration with Media Labs Asia and by the support of the Ministry of Communication & Information Technology. Chanderi has a population of around 30,000 (2001 census) members of which a third belong to weaving communities; of these communities more than 60 percent of the looms belong to Muslim families. Earlier the poor weavers were dependent on the latter because they lacked the purchasing power to buy raw material and did not own their own looms. These weavers also lacked the skills to create their designs or even approach customers for orders. The project primarily involved providing technical education to the textile weavers leading to, in the process, some 30 computers centers being opened and run for weavers to learn to create new designs by using special software (CAD). At the same time, DEF has also been digitally preserving old traditional handloom designs at its resource center. Weavers, with the help of printouts of designs created by them, are putting the latter into the loom.

The Chanderiyaan project is involved with weavers throughout the entire life cycle of crafting.

DEF's Chanderiyaan project has helped develop the knowledge and skills of the poor weavers of Chanderi in several ways. The project's activities include a skill builder program, forming of self-help groups, and the provision of handlooms to the poor, weavers' block printing, and kalamkari. They also include managing the Chanderi e-Commerce portals. Another part of the Chanderiyaan initiative is the Chanderi Integrated ICT for Development Program (CIDP) through which DEF has been promoting entrepreneurship, healthcare, education, and tourism. Deployment of ICT in the social entrepreneurship program is part of the CIDP; this includes a setup for tailoring, weaving, and embroidery work requiring hardware like a plotter printer for printing Chanderi sari designs at the resource center. This center has, so far, trained more than 150 people in the weaving process on looms, embroidery work, and block printing on clothes. A Jacquard block-printing machine was also procured to print weaving designs on clothes. More than 90 people have been trained, and more than 40 students are currently undergoing training on computerized integrated embroidery designs providing end-to-end solution.

So far, the resource centre has created and digitally stored in their design library more than 3500 Chanderi designs by training more than 105 weavers in design making. More than 350 students have also been trained in apparel designing and tailoring. Also undergoing training are more than 40 students in stitching work, and 68 students in skill builder program.



Figure 2 below shows the various stakeholders who have worked closely with DEF on this project. Figure 3 shows the CWICTRC business processes and supply chain. Figure 4 discusses how the CWICTRC has helped reduce the four market separations at BOP in Chanderi. Figure 5 discusses how DEF has bridged market separations in Chanderi for weavers, working closely with dozens of self-help groups (SHGs) to maintain and develop the weavers' supply chain.

<b>Goals/Mission</b>	<b>Stakeholders Activities</b>	<b>Designing</b>	<b>Weaving</b>	<b>Apparel Production</b>	<b>E-commerce And Retails</b>
Earning money through sustainable livelihood	<b>Chanderi Community</b>	Learning and creating design on the computer	Putting that design into the handloom.	Preparing final products	Present at retail shop for selling
Empowering people through information	<b>Digital Empowerment Foundation</b>	Providing training for computerizing textile designs	Providing raw material linkages	Proving space for stocking the final product	selling though e-commerce
Establishing and facilitating ICT application	<b>Media Lab Asia</b>	Media Lab Asia is supplying all the ICT resources– card punching machine, CHIC, CARPET and CAD software. Trained 12 master designers for helping weavers.		NA	DEF and Media Lab Asia have jointly built up e-commerce website.
Promoting of Electronics and IT-IT enable service industry	<b>Department Of Information Technology Govt. of India</b>	Proving fund and monitoring on CWICTRC project			

**Figure 2: CWICTRC Stakeholders' Activities**

<b>Business Process</b>	<b>Supply Chain</b>	<b>Involvement</b>	<b>Before CWICTRC</b>	<b>After CWICTRC</b>	<b>Market Separations</b>
Place	MP State Govt.	DEF	At home, at SHG Centre	Raja Rani	

**Figure 3: CWICTRC Business Processes, and Supply Chain**

\*BFC – Barefoot College, \*MEF – Mother Earth Craft, \*SESA - Self Employed Women’s Association, \*DEF – Digital Empowerment Foundation

<b>Stakeholders Market Separation</b>	<b>Spatial Separation</b>	<b>Temporal Separation</b>	<b>Informational Separation</b>	<b>Financial Separation</b>	<b>Knowledge/ Capability Separation (New)</b>
<b>Chanderi Community</b>	They are present in retail outlet. Customers are directly reaching to them	Chanderi weavers are producing apparel faster than ever before. Also time required to reach the latest designs/products to market is reduced	Sharing information about exhibitions	Spending their incomes into buying raw-material	Shown eagerness to learn new techniques and skills.



<b>Separation</b>	<b>DEF- SHG Supply Chain</b>							
	<b>Sourcing</b>		<b>Manufacturing</b>					<b>Retail &amp; Marketing</b>
<b>Supply Chain</b>	<b>Hand Looms</b>	<b>Raw Materials</b>	<b>Weavers</b>	<b>Designing</b>	<b>Weaving</b>	<b>Embroidering</b>	<b>Block Printing</b>	<b>Marketing</b>
<b>Spatial Separation</b>	Bridging the physical gaps between looms manufacturers & weavers	Bridging the physical gaps between raw material manufacturers						



hitherto unemployed children of weavers who are now actively engaged in some role in the supply chain of the business with some in sales, some in designing, while others are directly involved in weaving.

DEF has also launched an e-commerce website [<http://chanderiyaan.net/>] that has been successful in removing/ reducing spatial separation between the buyer and the seller. DEF has also introduced ICT-based services for Chanderi weavers. Introducing new technologies to the unpenetrated areas helps remove/ reduce temporal separation. Weavers earning more weaving charges (when they weave for other master weavers) or getting more profits when they weave and sell directly, has led to reduction in financial separation. DEF provides training programs on cloth design, apparel design, and finished product design, which enhances the weavers' knowledge-base. This how, knowledge/capability separation gets removed/ reduced.

MLA activities have also helped to remove/ reduce separation. MLA, in collaboration with DE, providing ICT-based support in CWICTRC, where all the weavers are working together reducing spatial separation. MLA has also introduced a card punching machine, CHIC, CARPET and CAD software tool, which is helping reduce designing time leading to reduction in temporal separation. The entire cost of this technical setup has been borne by Ministry of IT, thus helping indirectly reduce market separations in the Chanderi market. Besides, MLA and DEF are providing training and supply technical equipments, which actually help the weavers reduce/ remove knowledge/ capability separation. MLA has been instrumental in developing, implementing, and operating the e-health project that aims to keep the weavers healthy at all times and ensure that no setback occurs to their regular incomes. MLA has also been instrumental in promoting tourism at Chanderi by operationalizing the tourism website and providing mobile-based information to tourists.

DEF is closely attached with SHGs that were formed by DEF. Working closely with these Self-Help Groups DEF has been providing them with capital. It also helps them manage the capital and monitor how the capital is used in terms of purchasing of raw materials, paying weaving charges, and collecting the money from the market after selling. There is also a production manager, a member of the SHG, who manages the production and marketing of the products and is paid a salary from DEF. At the end of the year, profits generated from these operations are distributed among the SHG members. At the time of writing this case, the economy of the Chanderi weavers was estimated by DEF to be approximately Rs 150 crores, a huge leap from around Rs 70 crores in less than 3 years.

Broadly speaking, there are three stages in the supply chain- sourcing, manufacturing, and retailing. At each stage of the supply chain, DEF has reduced market separations. After DEF came to Chanderi it provided over 30 handloom machines to the poorest weavers enabling them to weave and earn a livelihood, thus reducing spatial and financial separations. Raw material is another important aspect of weaving. Here DEF provides linkages, which again helps remove/ reduce the separations. Weavers play the main role in weaving. DEF has formed an SHG reducing, thereby, spatial separations among the

weavers. DEF got the permission from the government to use the premises of the famous Rajarani Mahal, which is now being used by the weavers for weaving and for training on designing. At the same place, weavers get trained on weaving patterns and embroidery. Due to computerization of the designing process the estimated time has gone down from 10-15 days (when it was done manually) to less than a day, thanks to the card punching machine. Similarly, it took the weavers 20-25 days for setting the loom for a new design, which has now reduced to less than 3 days.

The last stage of this supply chain is retailing and marketing. Through the e-commerce website customers can now purchase products at any time, although the website is still in its pilot stage. DEF also provides information on low price handloom and good quality low price raw materials. Along with this, DEF provides training on computerized design and weaving. At the end of the supply chain, DEF provides information on different exhibitions. All these activities help reduce information separation. DEF has also tied up with garment factories and has been getting the weavers trained for sewing in order to prepare manufacturing apparels in the near future. Before DEF plans to exit the ecosystem it created in Chanderi, it wants it to run in a sustainable manner. For example, one of the objectives is to increase the number of looms with poor weavers, from 30 today to almost 150 in the near future. Other objectives include running IGNOU certified and DOEACC certified courses commercially, and registering itself with MP Tourism. If the Chanderi market becomes sustainable in the medium term- two years as decided by DEF- (the government currently provides a grant of Rs 11 million to DEF, and MLA to support the project)- then it would be a real test of market development as a consequence of bridging market separations.

The Chanderi town is estimated to generate Rs 65 crores (\$ 13 Million) of business annually. Most weavers have admitted to their incomes increasing from Rs. 3000/- to Rs. 6000/- because of the Chanderiyaan project. Moreover, the project has resulted in making 90% of the weaver population reduce its dependence on master weavers (large businesspersons who acted as intermediaries in the supply chain), thus disentangling themselves from their exploitative practices, and developing their capabilities such that their market participation increases.

## **Appendix**

### **Wireless supporting Tele health programme**

The public health centre in Chanderi has a tele-health facility provided by DEF & Media Lab Asia. This tele-health facility was facing the issue of internet connectivity. The Chanderi Wireless project has now ensured seamless internet connectivity. Local doctors are now able to connect with senior doctors working in district headquarter hospitals. This has enabled doctors to send their patients' medical reports like ECG, BP, and Blood Sugar to district hospitals for referral suggestions. Around 15-20 patients receive tele-health facility every day supported by improved connectivity.

### **Wireless contributing in design repository**



The wireless project has contributed in generating a design repository in Chanderi. Weavers have accessed connectivity to source design patterns based on which new designs are being created. Till December 2011, the design repository has more than 250 new design patterns that are regularly sourced by the weavers to plant on raw woven cloth.

### **Wireless supporting Schools & Madarsas in Chanderi**

The project has resolved the issue of internet connectivity in 13 schools, including one girls' school and two (2) Madarsas (Islamic Education Centre), which never had experienced ICT lab and internet connectivity. Thus, students and teachers are now able to access information and knowledge for their education and curriculum activities. All the 11 schools and 2 madrasas of Chanderi are also connected with wireless connection. Each of these have also been provided 2 computers each by Chanderiyaan to develop their ICT Lab.

### **Wireless supporting Digital Panchayat Centre**

In Chanderi, there are 40 village councils, which have never experienced of internet connected, are now utilizing the facility of internet for their official purpose at the Digital Panchayat Centre. Panchayat members are now using this facility for day-to-day work of panchayat such as creation of online content, maintaining database of NREGA (National Rural Employment Guarantee Act) scheme, etc.

### **Media Lab Asia led TeleMedicine project**

It is also a part of the Chanderiyaan project. The telemedicine component works through the Community Health Center (CHC) at Chanderi provided by the government. The CHC operates out of a small room which has the complete MLA's tele-health kit and a computer with a link to district head quarter hospital for referrals and diagnosis based on the information of the patient sent from local Chanderi based hospital. This health-based initiative has helped to keep the weavers at Chanderi healthy, thus ensuring a stable level of their incomes. MLA also has led the initiatives on promoting virtual tourism, and ensuring preliminary-level designing software for training and capacity building.

### **Wireless for Community Project**

An independent project from DEF helps to provide and enable last mile internet access provisioning through wireless networking technologies using free spectrum. Chanderiyaan project became the first cluster-based project with wireless for community project being tried, and tested. Today, the entire 3-5 kilometers of the Chanderi is completely wi-fi enabled. Any local resident can become member of the community created by Chanderiyaan and avail the internet connection through wi-fi, like more than 100 connections with unlimited use already present as members of the Chanderiyaan community. The impact of w4c project has made even government officials and offices want the connection from Chanderiyaan rather than from BSNL. w4c is a unique project

initiated by Internet Society and DEF, where ISOC has also been contributing with financial support.

### **Case Study 2: Barefoot College**

Barefoot College (BFC) was established in Rajasthan, India in 1972 with the aim to provide villagers in rural hinterlands opportunity to learn and thereby a chance to improve their standard of living. Formerly referred to as Social Work and Research Centre (SWRC), BFC operated as an NGO in the areas of education, water, solar energy, healthcare, handicrafts, and vocational training. Education was the primary sector of operations. Rural children were denied the opportunity for getting educated as they were viewed as a wage earner at home. Hence BFC innovated by introducing the concept of night schools which did not hamper with the daytime work of the children. The coursework was also innovative with the content funny and interesting to elicit interest of the children.

BFC works in the sector of water included installation of 1300 hand pumps, 200 water tanks and a large-scale rainwater harvesting project. Solar Energy was one of the later initiatives taken by BFC. In 1989, BFC initiated the solar energy project that received interest from countries in Africa and Asia. Participants were given the certificate of Barefoot Solar Engineer with six months of training. BFC also introduced solar cooker, solar pumps and solar lantern that helped villagers increase their means of earning a livelihood by helping them work for 4 more hours at night. After completion of training, villagers would go back to their villages and setup Rural Electronic Workshop for training fellow villagers.

BFC also did substantial work in the field of healthcare. It helped bring basic healthcare

because of the afraid to lose one earning person. In rural area, girls were most neglected persons; there was a concept of child marriage. In 1975, BFC started night school. The concept of night school toiled, because it was not hampering their working time as well as earning also. The course curriculum was not in a regular format. Course structure was very interesting, realistic, and funny, so that children became curious to attend the classes. Through the night school, BFC increased decision making power, ability to perform in real situation, and other activities like 'Bal Mela'.

**Key Information:-**

Since 1975, over 50000 children have passed through night school, and after passing school most of them were engaged in working in different department of barefoot college.

**Water:-**

**Key Information:-**

SWRC Installed 1300 hand pumps.

Nearly 200 tanks has been constructed with capacity of approximately 1.5 core little rain water.

Neerjaal initiative has been taken by BFC associating with DEF and Global Rainwater Harvesting Collective (GRWHC). This was an initiative of collecting information on water of the different villages.

**Livelihood:** - Livelihood was provided in all possible sectors. BFC initiative itself was generate half of the new livelihood, because they didn't use urban expertise. BFC trained poor peoples, made them capable to work as Barefoot Mechanical Engineer, Barefoot Solar Engineer, Barefoot Artist, and Barefoot Carpenter. That was a simple way to generate livelihoods.

**Solar Energy:** - Until 1989, every initiative worked successfully, but some how BFC realized that there was a gap into their initiatives and that gap was fulfilled by Solar Energy. This initiative was unbeaten therefore poor people from Africa, Bhutan and Afghanistan came into Tilonia campus for six months training. BFC enthusiasm, motivational skill helps to carried out 60 years old grandmothers to learning solar technology, and became Barefoot Solar Engineers. Not only engineer, but teacher also. They had introduced solar pump, solar lantern and solar cooker in the villages, which helped villagers to lead their life in a better way. They could work 4 more hours at the night time. This initiative was also helped to generate livelihood. After completion of training, villagers went back to their respective villages; they had done setup of Rural Electronic Workshop (REW). Few members were working in REW and got stipend. Through this was BFC generated livelihood for poor villagers.

**How BFC reduce market separations**

BFC is present in are working in different sectors such as solar energy, education, water, health, and craft. At micro level, they are helping poorest people of the world, who live in remote villages, but are they working alone? – Definitely No. They have also corporate tie ups, and seek funds from Government. Barefoot College trained poorest people, so

install workshop there by trained people – They have trained more interested people from their village – repair & maintenance work done in centre.

**Clause:** - BFC involved maximum women in every initiative.

**Reason:** - They found men are un-trainable, restless, impulsive, ambitious, and they wanted to get a certificate. The moment they got a certificate; they left from the village, and went to city for job searching.

**Clause:** - Every trainer was barely literate.

**Reason:** They did not want to depend on urban expertise. They wanted to learn by themselves, and wanted to become self-sufficient.

**Clause:** - In every initiative they have searched and made poorest poor people's involvement.

**Reason**

more 4 hours, they could produce more products, and by sell them was earnings more

**Table 2: BFC Solar Energy: Market Separation**

Stakeholders Market Separation	<b>Spatial Separation</b>	<b>Temporal Separation</b>	<b>Informational Separation</b>	<b>Financial Separation</b>	<b>Knowledge/ Capability Separation</b>
--------------------------------------	-------------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------------	---------------------------------	---

**BFC** Avail light  
facility at  
village

**Table 3: BFC – Solar Energy Business Process, Supply Chain, and Effects**

<b>Business Process</b>	<b>Supply Chain</b>	<b>Involvement</b>	<b>Before Solar Energy</b>	<b>After Solar Energy</b>	<b>Market Separations</b>
Place	Rajasthan Govt.	BFC*	Electronic Light	Solar Light	Financial, Informational
Fund	Foreign, CAPART, Govt.	BFC			Financial
Purchase Instruments	Exide	BFC			Informational
Training to BOP Peoples	BOP*	BFC			Informational, Knowledge
Service at BOP	BOP	BFC			Financial, Informational, Knowledge
REW*	BOP	BFC			Financial, Informational,
Earning	BOP	BFC			Financial



**Table 4: BFC – Solar Energy Supply Chain**

<b>Separation</b>	<b>Sourcing</b>	<b>Service</b>	<b>Feedback</b>				
<b>Supply Chain</b>	Electroni c Instrume nt	Raw Materia l	BOP People	Training to BOP	Service at BOP	Earning	Feedback

<b>Financial Separation</b>	BFC proving the expenses of electronic instrumen ts	BFC proving the expenses of raw materials	BOP peoples are now earning throug h solar energy	BFC proving the expenses of training	?	More productio n hours give more income	
<b>Knowledge/Capability Separation</b>				BOP peoples are getting knowledge about solar energy	BOP peoples are getting knowledge of repair & maintenanc e		

**Concluding remarks**

In our analysis of these two non-profit organizations, Digital Empowerment Foundation (DEF), and Barefoot College, we try to show how NGOs may help to develop markets at BOP by reducing market separations. Leveraging Bartel’s(1968) theoretical lens of market separations, and by finding and adding the fifth and a new market separation, “Capability Separation” our case studies provide new insights on market separations perspective to developing markets at BOP by paying more attention to specific market separations that inhibit market development. We also propose that capabilities separation is the not only the ‘only human separation’ but also acts as a catalyst such that reducing this separation accelerates reduction in the other four market separations. Towards this objective identification of capabilities or knowledge separation (of poor producers/consumers at BOP) as a key market separation forms one of the major contributions of our research.

## References

Bakos, Y. 1998. The emerging role of electronic marketplaces on the Internet. *Communications of the ACM*, 41(8). 35–42.

Bartels, R. 1968. “The General Theory of Marketing,” *Journal of Marketing* (32:1), pp. 29-33.

De Soto, Hernando 2000. *The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else*, New York: Basic Books.

Karnani, A. 2007. “The Mirage of Marketing to the Bottom of the Pyramid: How the Private Sector can Help Alleviate Poverty,” *California Management Review* (49:4), pp. 90-111.

Prahalad, C.K. 2005. *The Fortune at the Bottom of the Pyramid: Eradicating Poverty through Profits*